
RESEARCH NOTE

The Association study of nonsyndromic cleft lip with or without cleft palate identified risk variants of the *GLI3* gene in a Chinese population

YIRUI WANG^{1,2,3,*}, YIMIN SUN^{1,2,3,4,*}, LILI YU^{5,6,7,*}, YONGCHU PAN^{8,*}, BING SHI^{9,10},
JIAN MA^{5,6,7}, LAN MA⁸, FEIFEI LAN^{11,12,13}, YUXI ZHOU^{2,3} JIAYU SHI¹⁴, JINFANG
ZHU^{5,6}, HONGBING JIANG⁸, LEI ZHANG^{2,3}, XUE XIAO^{2,3}, MIN JIANG^{6,7} AIHUA
YIN^{11,12,13,#}, YONGQING HUANG^{5,6,7,#}, JING CHENG^{1,2,3,#}, LIN WANG^{8,#} & YINXUE
YANG^{6,7#}.

¹*Department of Biomedical Engineering, Medical Systems Biology Research Center,
Tsinghua University School of Medicine, Beijing 100084, China.*

²*CapitalBio Corporation, Beijing 102206, China.*

³*National Engineering Research Center for Beijing Biochip Technology, Beijing 102206,
China.*

⁴*The State Key Laboratory Breeding Base—Shenzhen Key Laboratory of Chemical Biology,
The Graduate School at Shenzhen, Tsinghua University, Shenzhen 518055, China.*

⁵*Department of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, Affiliated Hospital of Stomatology, Ningxia
Medical University, Yinchuan 750004, China.*

⁶*General Hospital of Ningxia Medical University, Yinchuan 750004, China.*

⁷*National Engineering Research Center for Beijing Biochip Technology, Sub-center in
Ningxia, Yinchuan 750004, China.*

⁸*Jiangsu Key Laboratory of Oral Diseases, Nanjing Medical University, Nanjing 210029,
China.*

⁹*The State Key Laboratory of Oral Diseases, Sichuan University, Chengdu 610041, China.*

¹⁰*West China College of Stomatology, Sichuan University, Chengdu 610041, China.*

¹¹ *Medical Genetic Center, Guangdong Women and Children Hospital, Guangzhou 511442, China.*

¹² *Maternal and Children Metabolic-Genetic Key Laboratory, Guangdong Women and Children Hospital, Guangzhou 511442, China.*

¹³ *Biobank of Guangdong Women and Children Hospital, Guangzhou 511442, China.*

¹⁴ *Division of Growth and Development and Section of Orthodontics, School of Dentistry, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA 90095.*

* These authors contributed equally to this work.

These authors jointly supervised this work.

Correspondence and requests for materials should be addressed to Y.Y. (email: nyfyyyx@126.com,) or to L.W.(email: lw603@njmu.edu.cn) or to J.C. (email: jcheng@tsinghua.edu.cn,) or to Y.H. (email: yongqinghuang6510@126.com,) or to A.H. (email: yinafwa@vip.126.com,).

Runing title: Yirui Wang, NSCL/P risk variants of the *GLI3*

Key words: NSCL/P; *GLI3*; association study; risk variants

Nonsyndromic Cleft lip with or without cleft palate (NSCL/P) is a common birth defect due to abnormal orofacial development. Previous studies report abnormal sonic hedgehog (SHH) signaling activity during NSCL/P pathogenesis and propose several genes in the SHH pathway as candidate risk genes. As such, we focused on *GLI3*, a downstream modulator of the SHH pathway. In the present study, we genotyped 34 tag SNPs covering *GLI3* and performed association analysis with NSCL/P in 504 cases and 455 healthy controls. Our preliminary results identified risk variants of *GLI3* that associated with NSCL/P susceptibility in a Chinese population. In particular, rs3801161 and its haplotype rs3801161-rs7785287 displayed significant association with NSCL/P and survived Bonferroni correction for

multiple comparisons. The robustness of the association between *GLI3* and NSCL/P is worth of further examination in the future across different populations.

It is known that CL/P results from abnormal craniofacial development during embryogenesis [Ferguson, et al., 1998]. Craniofacial developmental includes formation of the lip and palate, which involves a complex series of cellular and molecular events. As such, several signaling pathways and genes have been proposed as promising candidates to understand the etiology of NSCL/P [Vieira, 2006]. Sonic hedgehog (SHH) signaling is one of the most studied candidate pathways because it plays an important role in regulating palatal growth [Lan, et al., 2009]. Disruption of SHH signaling in animal models results in increased occurrence of CL/P [Lipinski, et al., 2010;]. Therefore, it is believed that abnormal SHH signaling activity contributes to the etiology and pathogenesis of NSCL/P. In humans, mutations in *PTCH*, a key gene in the SHH signaling pathway, have been identified in NSCL/P cases [Mansilla, et al., 2006]. Follow-up association and functional studies provide further evidence supporting the role of *PTCH* in NSCL/P [Letra, et al., 2010;]. The identification of the SHH pathway and the *PTCH* gene provide new insight into the understanding of the etiology of NSCL/P and imply that other genes in the SHH pathway might be candidate genes for NSCL/P as well.

The *GLI3* (GLI family zinc finger 3) gene is located on chromosome 7p14.1 and encodes a zinc-finger transcription factor [Abbasi, et al., 2009]. As a key downstream modulator of the SHH pathway, appropriate regulation of *GLI3* expression is important for the development of embryonic craniofacial structures in mammals and other vertebrates [Rice, et al., 2006]. Animal studies indicate that *GLI3*-deficient mice have increased incidence of cleft palate due to abnormal tongue development [Huang, et al., 2008]. In humans, *GLI3* mutations have been identified in a group of phenotypes, including Greig cephalopolysyndactyly syndrome (GCPS), Pallister-Hall syndrome (PHS), and postaxial polydactyly, which are collective known as *GLI3* morphopathies [Radhakrishna, et al., 1999]. Recent molecular

analysis of *GLI3* mutations further expand its phenotypic spectrum and propose robust genotype-phenotype correlations [Johnston, et al., 2010; Démurger, et al., 2015]. Although *GLI3* morphopathies have distinct clinical characteristics, the craniofacial abnormalities such as CL/P are identified as primary features shared by different syndromes associated with *GLI3* mutations.

Thus, based on current genetic evidence from animal models and syndromic patients, it is believed that the *GLI3* gene plays an important role in the etiology and pathogenesis of CL/P. Therefore, *GLI3* is another promising candidate gene in the SHH pathway for NSCL/P research. Although some *GLI3* mutations with deleterious and pathogenic effects have been identified, these mutations are rare and, therefore, seem unlikely to be prevalent among the more common form of CL/P (*i.e.*, NSCL/P). As such, common genetic polymorphisms of *GLI3* might be risk factors contributing to NSCL/P susceptibility.

In the present study, we used *GLI3* as a candidate gene and performed case-control-based association analysis in a large, unrelated Chinese NSCL/P cohort. In total, 504 NSCL/P cases and 455 healthy controls were recruited from the Western China Hospital of Stomatology, Sichuan University. This study was approved by the Ethical Committee of Sichuan University. Written consent and peripheral blood samples were obtained from each participant. All participants were genetically unrelated Han Chinese. They were interviewed and clinically assessed by an experienced oral surgeon based on detailed diagnostic information from medical records and physical examinations to exclude individuals with syndromic orofacial clefts or other major congenital defects. Subjects in the control group were healthy individuals without a family history of orofacial clefts or other major congenital defects. The age and sex of control samples were matched with case samples. In total, 34 tag SNPs covering the *GLI3* gene were selected using the Tagger program [de Bakker, et al., 2005] with parameters of minor allele frequency >5% and pairwise r^2 threshold of 0.8. Linkage

disequilibrium analysis and haplotype selection were performed using Haploview software [Barrett, et al., 2005]. Genotyping of all tag SNPs was performed at CapitalBio Corporation (Beijing, China) with the MassARRAY platform (Sequenom Inc, San Diego, CA) according to the manufacturer's protocol. Briefly, genomic DNA was extracted from whole blood from each individual using a Wizard[®] Genomic DNA Purification Kit (Promega, Madison, WI.). The DNA concentration was determined using a NanoDrop 1000 (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Waltham, MA). Multiplex reaction primers were designed using the MassARRAY Assay Design software package (v3.1). Mass determination was performed with a MALDI-TOF mass spectrometer, and MassARRAY[®] TYPER 4.0 genotyping software was used for data acquisition.

All of the selected SNPs were individually evaluated by Hardy-Weinberg equilibrium (HWE) in controls. Their associations with NSCLP were analyzed under different models (additive, dominant, recessive, and genotype) and in haplotypes using PLINK software [Purcell, et al., 2007]. The odds ratio (OR) and its corresponding 95% confidence intervals (95% CI) were used to indicate the effective size of each SNP and haplotype. The association results were also adjusted by sex through logistic regression during single marker and haplotype analysis. Bonferroni correction was applied for multiple comparisons.

The complete *GLI3* genotyping results are listed in Supplement Table S1. The raw genotyping data were adjusted for age and sex, and Bonferroni correction was then performed for multiple comparisons. Herein, Table 1 shows selected SNPs exceeding the significance threshold ($P < 0.05$) after data adjustment. The association analysis under the additive model identified the G allele of rs3801161 showing strong association ($P = 0.00097$) and the G allele of rs846401 showing marginal association ($P = 0.05$). In addition, several SNPs emerged as significant ones under the genotype, dominant, and recessive models. As such, rs3801161 in the AG genotype ($P = 0.004$) and under the dominant model ($P = 0.001$), rs2237421 in the TT

genotype ($P = 0.05$), rs846290 under the recessive model ($P = 0.04$), rs10951667 under the recessive model ($P = 0.05$), rs1003876 in the AT genotype ($P = 0.05$) and under the dominant model ($P = 0.05$), rs846401 in the GG genotype ($P = 0.02$) and under the recessive model ($P = 0.01$), rs3801212 in the GG genotype ($P = 0.03$) and under the recessive model ($P = 0.02$), and rs3801228 in the GG genotype ($P = 0.03$) and under the recessive model ($P = 0.03$) displayed nominal significant association with NSCL/P. However, after Bonferroni correction for multiple comparisons, only rs3801161 was significant.

We built eight blocks within the *GLI3* gene using Haploview software (Supplement Fig. S1). Table 2 shows the eight haplotypes of *GLI3* and their association with NSCL/P. The rs3801161-rs7785287 haplotype (block 3) is the only *GLI3* haplotype that showed overall significant association (OMINIBUS $P = 0.007$) and survived Bonferroni correction for multiple comparisons in the GC genotype ($P = 0.0009$).

The complex etiology underlying NSCL/P remains elusive. Given the proposed role of the SHH signaling pathway during craniofacial development, genes connected to the SHH pathway such as *PTCH* have emerged as promising candidates to identify genetic etiologies underlying NSCL/P [Mansilla, et al.,]. In the present study we identified risk variants of *GLI3*, namely rs3801161 and its haplotype rs3801161-rs7785287, that exceeded the significance threshold ($P < 0.05$) and survived Bonferroni correction for multiple comparisons. The OR values implicated that the G allele of rs3801161 and G-C haplotype of rs3801161-rs7785287 block may raise the risk of NSCL/P. In the significant level of $P < 0.05$, the power of the study of the association of rs3801161 is 71%, which is calculated using CaTS software [Skol, et al. 2006] Therefore, *GLI3* is likely another candidate gene identified in the SHH pathway that contributes to NSCL/P susceptibility.

These results are in accordance with the described role of *GLI3* in previous reports [Abbasi, et al.,2013].It is known that CL/P results from abnormal development of the

secondary palate during embryonic development [Ferguson, et al., 1988]. The SHH signaling pathway is believed to play an essential role for palatal outgrowth by triggering appropriate signals to repress or activate its downstream targets [Lan, et al., 2009]. The *GLI3* gene belongs to a family of GLI transcriptional factors that plays a secondary role in mediating SHH signals [Abbasi, et al., 2009]. In mice, the *GLI3* gene is widely expressed in the palatal mesenchyme [Rice, et al., 2006]. The *GLI3* deficiency in mice results in abnormal development of the tongue and increased incidence of cleft secondary palate [Huang, et al., 2008]. In humans, the *GLI3* mutations have been identified in a group of developmental disorders in which CL/P is a shared primary phenotype [Radhakrishna, et al., 1999; Johnston, et al., 2010; Démurger, et al., 2015;]. Syndromic CL/P is usually caused by rare and deleterious genetic mutations that are unlikely to be prevalent among large populations. In contrast, for the most common form of CL/P (*i.e.*, NSCL/P), common SNPs may contribute to disease susceptibility with modest effects. Therefore, we selected tag SNPs of *GLI3* to perform association analyses. It should be noted that tag SNPs are usually used as genetic markers representing a cluster of SNPs in linkage disequilibrium, and therefore, the actual causal variant might be tagged. As such, SNP imputation could be an option to estimate the association of the rest of the SNPs tagged by rs3801161 [Halperin, et al., 2009]. The significant SNP rs3801161 can tag four SNPs in a 23kb region and the significant haplotype block rs3801161-rs7785287 can tag 7 SNPs in a 27kb region. These SNPs are in high LD with rs3801161 or rs7785287 ($r^2 > 0.8$). This region is in the 8th intron of *GLI3* gene.

Meanwhile, functional investigation of *GLI3* genetic variants could be direct and convincing. It was reported that conserved non-coding sequences within *GLI3* can act as intron enhancers with cis-regulatory effects on *GLI3* expression in embryonic craniofacial structures and internal organs [Abbasi, et al., 2013]. Therefore, the role of rs3801161 and its tagged region during *GLI3* expression is worthy of future characterization.

In conclusion, we used *GLI3* as candidate NSCL/P gene and performed an association study in a large unrelated Chinese cohort. Our preliminary results indicated that rs3801161 and its haplotype rs3801161-rs7785287 are risk variants contributing to NSCL/P susceptibility. To our knowledge, this is the first study reporting a significant association between *GLI3* and NSCL/P. Our results provide further evidence supporting the involvement of the SHH pathway, and in particular the *GLI3* gene, underlying the genetic etiology of NSCL/P. As is a preliminary research, the observed association should be further validate in expanded cohorts across different populations. The functional characterization of the risk variant of *GLI3* is also important to uncover the explicit role of *GLI3* underlying NSCL/P etiology and pathology.

Conflict of interest All authors declare they have no conflict of interest.

Acknowledgments

This work is funded by the China National High-Tech Research and Development Program Grant (2012AA020101) and partly funded by the National Key Basic Research Program Grant (2012CB720703), the Key Project of the National Natural Science Foundation of China (81230022, 81170981, and 81200808), the National Natural Science Foundation of China (81160131), Ph.D. Programs Foundation of Ministry of Education of China(20113234110003), the Key Project of the Ningxia Province Natural Science Foundation(NZ141116), and the Natural Science Foundation of Jiangsu Province (BK2012447). The authors thank all participants who donated biological samples and questionnaire information to this study. We thank all staff and students who have worked on this project.

Table 1. The selected GLI3 genotyping results.

SNP	Patient	Control	Crude OR (95%CI)	unadjusted P-Value	Adjusted OR (95%CI)	Adjusted P-Value
rs3801161						
A	838	801	1		1	
G	166	105	1.51 (1.16-1.97)	0.002	1.57 (1.20-2.04)	0.00097*
AA	349	354	1		1	
AG	140	93	1.53 (1.13-2.06)	0.006	1.56 (1.15-2.11)	0.004
GG	13	6	2.2 (0.83-5.85)	0.11	2.52 (0.94-6.78)	0.07
Dom			1.57 (1.17-2.10)	0.003	1.61 (1.20-2.17)	0.001*
Rec			1.98 (0.75-5.26)	0.16	2.25 (0.84-6.02)	0.11
rs2237421						
C	556	462				
T	452	444	0.85 (0.71-1.01)	0.07	0.84 (0.70-1.01)	0.06
CC	150	117	1		1	
CT	256	228	0.88 (0.65-1.18)	0.39	0.88 (0.48-1.19)	0.41

TT	98	108	0.71 (0.49-1.02)	0.06	0.7 (0.48-1.00)	0.05
Dom			0.82 (0.62-1.09)	0.18	0.82 (0.62-1.10)	0.18
Rec			0.77 (0.57-1.05)	0.1	0.75 (0.55-1.03)	0.08
rs846290						
A	616	526				
C	392	380	0.88 (0.73-1.06)	0.17	0.87 (0.73-1.05)	0.15
AA	183	158				
AC	250	210	1.03 (0.78-1.36)	0.85	1.03 (0.78-1.37)	0.84
CC	71	85	0.72 (0.49-1.06)	0.09	0.71 (0.48-1.03)	0.07
Dom			0.94 (0.72-1.22)	0.64	0.94 (0.72-1.22)	0.62
Rec			0.71 (0.50-1.00)	0.05	0.69 (0.49-0.98)	0.04
rs10951667						
G	727	649				
A	279	259	0.96 (0.79-1.17)	0.7	0.96 (0.78-1.18)	0.72
GG	251	234				
GA	225	181	1.16 (0.89-1.51)	0.27	1.16 (0.89-1.52)	0.26

AA	27	39	0.65 (0.38-1.09)	0.1	0.65 (0.38-1.10)	0.11
Dom			1.07 (0.83-1.38)	0.61	1.07 (0.83-1.38)	0.59
Rec			0.6 (0.36-1.00)	0.05	0.61 (0.36-1.01)	0.05
rs1003876						
A	770	664				
T	236	240	0.85 (0.69-1.04)	0.12	0.83 (0.68-1.03)	0.08
AA	301	245				
AT	168	174	0.79 (0.60-1.03)	0.08	0.76 (0.58-1.00)	0.05
TT	34	33	0.84 (0.50-1.39)	0.5	0.82 (0.49-1.37)	0.45
Dom			0.79 (0.61-1.03)	0.08	0.77 (0.59-1.00)	0.05
Rec			0.92 (0.56-1.51)	0.74	0.91 (0.55-1.50)	0.72
rs846401						
A	625	527				
G	383	383	0.84 (0.70-1.01)	0.07	0.83 (0.68-1.00)	0.05
AA	179	151				
AG	267	225	1 (0.76-1.32)	0.99	0.99 (0.75-1.32)	0.96

GG	58	79	0.62 (0.41-0.93)	0.02	0.61 (0.41-0.92)	0.02
Dom			0.9 (0.69-1.18)	0.45	0.89 (0.68-1.17)	0.41
Rec			0.62 (0.43-0.89)	0.01	0.62 (0.43-0.89)	0.01
rs3801212						
A	801	714				
G	207	196	0.94 (0.76-1.17)	0.59	0.95 (0.76-1.19)	0.66
AA	311	286				
AG	179	142	1.16 (0.88-1.52)	0.29	1.18 (0.89-1.55)	0.24
GG	14	27	0.48 (0.25-0.93)	0.03	0.48 (0.25-0.94)	0.03
Dom			1.05 (0.81-1.36)	0.71	1.07 (0.82-1.39)	0.64
Rec			0.45 (0.23-0.87)	0.02	0.46 (0.24-0.88)	0.02
rs3801228						
A	890	779				
G	118	131	0.79 (0.60-1.03)	0.08	0.79 (0.60-1.03)	0.08
AA	390	336				
AG	110	107	0.89 (0.65-1.20)	0.43	0.89 (0.67-1.21)	0.47

GG	4	12	0.29 (0.09-0.90)	0.03	0.28 (0.09-0.88)	0.03
Dom			0.83 (0.61-1.11)	NA	0.83 (0.62-1.12)	0.22
Rec			0.3 (0.09-0.92)	NA	0.29 (0.09-0.90)	0.03

All SNPs were analyzed under the additive, genotype, dominant (Dom), and recessive (Rec) models.

The adjusted OR and adjusted P-value are the association results adjusted by sex. P < 0.05 is indicated in bold.

Significant results after Bonferroni correction are marked with an asterisk (*).

unedited version

Table 2. The haplotype analysis results of GLI3.

Haplotype	OR _{unadjusted}	P _{unadjusted}	OR _{adjusted}	P _{adjusted}
Block1 rs2237427-rs6969641				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.32		
CG	0.92	0.35	0.91	0.29
TG	0.85	0.41	0.86	0.44
TC	1.14	0.15	1.15	0.13
Block2 rs846300-rs1029589				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.13		
GA	1.12	0.24	1.13	0.21
CG	1.19	0.23	1.2	0.21
GG	0.84	0.05	0.83	0.04
Block3 rs3801161-rs7785287				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.007		
AT	0.95	0.61	0.95	0.596
GC	1.53	0.02	1.58	0.0009*
AC	0.85	0.09	0.84	0.07
Block4 rs10951667-rs846400				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.94		
AT	1	0.96	1.01	0.96
GT	1	1	1	0.98
GG	1.03	0.75	1.03	0.76
Block5 rs12668912-rs17753324-rs1003876				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.47		
TGT	0.85	0.12	0.83	0.08

TTA	0.97	0.86	0.98	0.92
TGA	0.95	0.85	0.92	0.74
CGA	1.15	0.13	1.17	0.09
Block6 rs3801202-rs10230715				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.86		
AA	0.97	0.82	0.99	0.95
GA	0.95	0.65	0.93	0.54
GG	1.06	0.58	1.06	0.57
Block7 rs3801211-rs846401-rs3801212				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.31		
CGG	0.92	0.48	0.93	0.54
TGA	0.81	0.1	0.8	0.08
CGA	0.98	0.92	0.95	0.83
CAA	1.17	0.1	1.18	0.09
Block8 rs17172023-rs3801220-rs17172024-rs3801228				
OMNIBUS	NA	0.55		
CATG	0.79	0.08	0.79	0.08
CGCA	1.02	0.89	1.04	0.81
CATA	1	1	0.98	0.89
TGTA	1.02	0.84	1.02	0.83
CGTA	1.09	0.37	1.09	0.37

The OR_{adjusted} and P_{adjusted} are the association results adjusted by sex. P < 0.05 is indicated in bold.

Significant results after Bonferroni correction are marked with an asterisk (*).

References

- Abbasi A. A., Goode D. K., Amir S., Grzeschik K. H. 2009 Evolution and functional diversification of the GLI family of transcription factors in vertebrates. *Evol. Bioinform. Online* **5**, 5-13.
- Abbasi A. A., Minhas R., Schmidt A., Koch S., Grzeschik K. H. 2013 Cis-regulatory underpinnings of human GLI3 expression in embryonic craniofacial structures and internal organs. *Dev. Growth Differ.* **55**, 699-709.
- de Bakker P. I., Yelensky R., Pe'er I., Gabriel S. B., Daly M. J., Altshuler D. 2005 Efficiency and power in genetic association studies. *Nat. Genet.* **37**, 1217-1223.
- Barrett J. C., Fry B., Maller J., Daly M. J. 2005 Haploview: analysis and visualization of LD and haplotype maps. *Bioinformatics* **21**, 263-265.
- Démurger F., Ichkou A., Mougou-Zerelli S., Le Merrer M., Goudefroye G., Delezoide A. L., et al. 2015 New insights into genotype-phenotype correlation for GLI3 mutations. *Eur. J. Hum. Genet.* **23**, 92-102.
- Ferguson M. W. 1988 Palate development. *Development* **103 Suppl**, 41-60.
- Halperin E., Stephan D. A. 2009 SNP imputation in association studies. *Nat. Biotechnol.* **27**, 349-351.
- Huang X., Goudy S. L., Ketova T., Litingtung Y., Chiang C. 2008 GLI3-deficient mice exhibit cleft palate associated with abnormal tongue development. *Dev. Dyn.* **237**, 3079-3087.
- Johnston J. J., Sapp J. C., Turner J. T., Amor D., Aftimos S., Aleck K. A., et al. 2010 Molecular analysis expands the spectrum of phenotypes associated with GLI3 mutations. *Hum. Mutat.* **31**, 1142-1154.

-
- Lan Y., Jiang R. 2009 Sonic hedgehog signaling regulates reciprocal epithelial-mesenchymal interactions controlling palatal outgrowth. *Development* **136**, 1387-1396.
- Letra A., Menezes R., Govil M., Fonseca R. F., McHenry T., Granjeiro J. M., *et al.* 2010 Follow-up association studies of chromosome region 9q and nonsyndromic cleft lip/palate. *Am. J. Med. Genet. part A* **152A**, 1701-1710.
- Lipinski R. J., Song C., Sulik K. K., Everson J. L., Gipp J.J., Yan D., *et al.* 2010 Cleft lip and palate results from Hedgehog signaling antagonism in the mouse: Phenotypic characterization and clinical implications. *Birth Defects. Res. A Clin. Mol. Teratol.* **88**, 232-240.
- Manolio T. A., Collins F. S., Cox N. J., Goldstein D. B., Hindorf L. A., Hunter D. J., *et al.* 2009 Finding the missing heritability of complex diseases. *Nature* **461**, 747-753.
- Mansilla M. A., Cooper M. E., Goldstein T., Castilla E. E., Lopez Camelo J. S., Marazita M. L., *et al.* 2006 Contributions of PTCH gene variants to isolated cleft lip and palate. *Cleft Palate Craniofac. J.* **43**, 21-29.
- Purcell S., Neale B., Todd-Brown K., Thomas L., Ferreira M. A., Bender D., *et al.* 2007 PLINK: a tool set for whole-genome association and population-based linkage analyses. *Am. J. Hum. Genet.* **81**, 559-575.
- Radhakrishna U., Bornholdt D., Scott H. S., Patel U. C., Rossier C., Engel H., *et al.* 1999 The phenotypic spectrum of GLI3 morphopathies includes autosomal dominant preaxial polydactyly type-IV and postaxial polydactyly type-A/B; No phenotype prediction from the position of GLI3 mutations. *Am. J. Hum. Genet.* **65**, 645-655.
- Rice R., Connor E., Rice D. P. 2006 Expression patterns of Hedgehog signalling pathway members during mouse palate development. *Gene Expr. Patterns* **6**, 206-212.

Skol A. D., Scott L. J., Abecasis G. R., Boehnke M. 2006 Joint analysis is more efficient than replication-based analysis for two-stage genome-wide association studies. *Nat. Genet.* **38**, 209-213.

Vieira A. R. 2006 Association between the transforming growth factor alpha gene and nonsyndromic oral clefts: a HuGE review. *Am. J. Epidemiol.* **163**,790–810.

Wehby G. L., Cassell C. H. 2010 The impact of orofacial clefts on quality of life and healthcare use and costs. *Oral Dis.* **16**, 3-10.

Received 4 September 2016; in final revised form 20 November 2016; accepted 22 November 2016

Unedited version published online: 25 November 2016

Unedited version