

which tends to  $\theta^2/2$  as  $n$  tends to infinity. Thus the desired limit is  $(1/2)(\cos^{-1} p_0)^2$ .

For example, if  $p_0 = 1/2$ , the limit is  $\pi^2/18$ ; and if  $p_0 = -1/2$ , it is  $2\pi^2/9$ . Note that  $p_0$  may even assume the values  $+1$  and  $-1$ , in which case the limits are  $0$  and  $\pi^2/2$  respectively.

**Solution to  
How Many Couples will Survive?**

TIO question appeared in *Resonance*, Vol.11, No.8, p.103, 2006.

**Problem:** Suppose there are  $2n$  individuals who constitute  $n$  married couples at a given initial date. We wish to consider the survivors at some given later date. Assume each individual having a probability  $p$  of surviving till the later date (and possibly more!) independent of the others. Let  $s$  denote the number of survivors at the later date and  $c$  denote the number of surviving couples (in which both partners are alive). The problem is to derive an expression for  $E(c/s)$  and show that it does not depend on  $p$ . What about  $E(s/c)$ ?

The problem was posed by Soubhik Chakraborty  
Lecturer in Statistics  
Marwari College  
T M Bhagalpur University  
Bhagalpur 812 007, India.  
Email:soubhik@yahoo.co.in

**Solution:**

There can be several methods of solving this interesting problem. Two of them are described here.

**First Method:** Define an indicator random variable  $I_j$  as follows:

$$I_j = 1, \quad \text{if } j\text{-th couple survives among the } s \text{ survivors} \\ = 0, \quad \text{otherwise}$$

where  $j = 1, 2, \dots, n$ .

Clearly  $E(I_j) = 0 \cdot P(I_j = 0) + 1 \cdot P(I_j = 1) = P(I_j = 1)$ .

Evidently,

$$E(c/s) = E\left(\sum_{j=1}^n I_j\right) = \sum_{j=1}^n E(I_j) = nP(I_j = 1) \quad (1)$$

**Keyword**  
Solution.



because the chance of survival till the later date is the same for every couple!

Next,  $s$  survivors out of  $2n$  individuals can be chosen in  ${}^{2n}C_s$  ways. If the  $j$ -th couple has to survive among the  $s$  survivors, fixing the  $j$ -th couple leaves  $2n - 2$  individuals from whom remaining  $s - 2$  survivors can be chosen in  ${}^{2n-2}C_{s-2}$  ways. As all outcomes are equally likely, we have

$$\begin{aligned} P(I_j = 1) &= \frac{{}^{2n-2}C_{s-2}}{{}^{2n}C_s} \\ &= \frac{s(s-1)}{2n(2n-1)}, \end{aligned}$$

after simplification.

Substituting this result in (1) gives

$$E(c/s) = \frac{s(s-1)}{2(2n-1)}$$

which is clearly independent of  $p$ .

**Second Method:** Define two indicator random variables as follows:

Let  $X_i = 1$ , if male of  $i$ -th couple survives among  $s$  survivors  
 $= 0$ , otherwise

and  $Y_i = 1$ , if female of  $i$ -th couple survives among the  $s$  survivors  
 $= 0$ , otherwise

where  $i = 1, 2, \dots, n$ .

Then

$$E(c/s) = E\left(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i Y_i\right) \quad (\text{why?}) \quad (2)$$

Now

$$P(X_i = 1) = \frac{s}{2n}$$

and

$$P(Y_i = 1/X_i = 1) = \frac{s-1}{2n-1}.$$

Since the chance of survival till the later date is the same for every couple, we have from (2),

$$\begin{aligned} E(c/s) &= nP(X_i = 1, Y_i = 1) \\ &= nP(Y_i = 1/X_i = 1)P(X_i = 1) \end{aligned}$$

(by multiplication theorem of probability)

$$\begin{aligned} &= n \left( \frac{s-1}{2n-1} \right) \frac{s}{2n} \\ &= \frac{s(s-1)}{2(2n-1)}, \text{ as desired.} \end{aligned}$$

However, it is of interest to note that the expression for  $E(s/c)$  contains  $p$ . To see why, observe that if there are  $c$  couples at the later date, we already have  $2c$  individuals surviving. Hence  $E(s/c) = 2c +$  expected number of survivors among the remaining  $(2n - 2c)$  individuals. Since each individual has a probability  $p$  of surviving till the later date independent of others, we immediately have

$$E(s/c) = 2c + (2n - 2c)p = 2np + 2c(1 - p),$$

an expression that does contain  $p$ .

**Remark:**

This problem was discussed by Daniel Bernoulli in the year 1768.

